



THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 CENTRE STREET 9TH FLOOR NORTH NEW YORK NY 10007
TEL: 212 669-7700 FAX: 212 669-7780



PERMIT CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

ISSUE DATE: 05/29/15	EXPIRATION DATE: 12/16/2020	DOCKET #: 167879	COFA #: COFA 16-8220
ADDRESS: 346 BROADWAY <u>Former New York Life Insurance Company Building</u> INDIVIDUAL LANDMARK		BOROUGH: MANHATTAN	BLOCK/LOT: 170 / 6

Display This Permit While Work Is In Progress

ISSUED TO:

Haim Hershkovitz
Civic Center Community Group Broadway LLC
c/o El Ad US Holding
575 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, NY 10022

Pursuant to Section 25-307 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, at the Public Meeting of December 16, 2014, following the Public Hearing and Public Meeting of November 18, 2014, voted to approve a proposal to construct a rooftop addition and bulkheads, replace windows, install a canopy, alter the facades, and relocate and alter interior finishes, as put forward in your application completed on October 23, 2014, and as you were notified in Status Update Letter 16-6036 issued on December 16, 2014.

The proposal as approved, consists of the demolition and reconstruction of the 13th floor in glass cladding measuring 13'8" in height, setback 6' from the balustrades on the north and south elevations and 9'8" from the Lafayette pavilion, and with a 3'6" glass guardrail at the roof; the construction of a 14th floor at the east and west portions of the building measuring approximately 11' in height, clad in glass, and with a 3'6" glass guardrail; the construction of two (2) mechanical enclosures and two (2) stair and elevator bulkheads at the center of the roof, clad in gray metal; the reconstruction of the Catherine Lane type balustrade with new cast stone piers, base and top rails and an open interlocking circle motif panel with an approximate 1'4" opening in cast stone finished to match the existing terra cotta; the reconstruction of the Leonard Street type balustrade, retaining the marble piers, base and rail, with new cast stone interlocking circle motif panels with an approximate 1'4" opening, finished to match the existing marble; at the Lafayette pavilion, the removal of infill from the masonry openings on all four elevations, and the installation of multilight aluminum windows with divided light fanlight transoms and the construction of a glass link to the 13th floor; at the Leonard Street elevation, the removal of the two fire escapes, and the installation of profiled marble to match the

adjacent; the removal of one (1) garage door and the installation of one (1) one-over-one window, masonry, and bronze single light door; the removal of masonry at two (2) window openings and the installation of bronze doors with transoms; the installation of a glass and bronze clad steel canopy at the primary entrance; at the Catherine Lane elevation, the removal of masonry at two (2) window openings and the installation of paired painted metal doors with a louver; the installation of paired painted metal doors within two (2) existing entrances; at the Lafayette Street elevation, the removal of masonry from two (2) window openings and the installation of bronze doors with transoms and flanking one-over-one aluminum windows; the installation of paired bronze doors within the restored wood frame at the center entrance; at the Broadway elevation, the removal of masonry from two (2) window openings and the installation of single light bronze doors with transoms; the installation of paired bronze doors at the center entrance with fixed sidelights with decorative ironwork behind the glazing, and the restoration of the decorative door infill; the installation of marble cladding at the niches; and building-wide window replacement with aluminum windows with a dark brown finish (Sherwin Williams SW6069 "French Roast") in the following configurations: one-over-one double-hung, triple hung arch-headed, tripartite one-over-one, double-hung at center with casements flanking, tripartite one-over-one with fixed transoms, and one-over-one double-hung with arched framing. The approved work at the designated interior includes within the Leonard Street lobby, the removal of the infill between the cast iron pilasters at the elevator banks at the ground and first floors, and the installation of decorative bronze grilles and gates; the relocation of a historic ceiling mounted clock from the Broadway corridor to the ceiling at the center of the ground floor level elevator bank; the removal and replacement of the terrazzo flooring to match the original marble floor pattern; at the first floor of the historic exit stair, the removal of the non-historic wall and the installation of bronze clad fire-rated infill, featuring glazed transoms, sidelights, and paired doors; the removal of the marble staircase connecting the first and second floors east of the Banking Hall, and the relocation of the staircase, marble wainscot and wall paneling, and decorative railing, to the proposed commercial lobby space at the northeast corner of the building adjacent to Lafayette Street; the removal of one marble tread and riser from the stair, and restoration of all relocated elements; within the second floor Executive Offices, encapsulating portions of the walls with partition walls to accommodate residential conversion; the restoration of all surfaces, and the removal of fluorescent lighting and non-historic grilles; shifting wood doors and their decorative surrounds in select locations along the same elevations within the interiors; at the fourth floor President's Offices, the removal of the marble anteroom, and relocation of the marble pilaster and dimensional elements to the first floor adjacent to the historic exit stair, featuring new marble paneling, terrazzo flooring, plaster ceiling with fiberglass profiled elements and salvaged rosettes, and four (4) salvaged wood doors and surrounds; encapsulating portions of the walls with partition walls within the fourth floor offices to accommodate residential conversion; shifting one (1) wood door and surround on the same elevation within the interior; at the fourteenth floor of the Clocktower, the restoration of the cast iron spiral stairs and retaining the counterweight and enclosure; the installation of a new stair connection to the 13th floor with a bronze picket guardrail; the installation of a bronze clad steel and glass elevator enclosure at the southwest corner; the installation of kitchen fixtures on the east elevation; at the fifteenth floor of the Clocktower, the restoration of the cast iron spiral stair and retaining the pendulum and enclosure; at the sixteenth floor of the Clocktower, the restoration of the cast iron spiral stair; disconnecting, retaining, and protecting the existing clock mechanism and the restoration of the wood and glass mechanism enclosure; and electrifying the clock operation. The proposal was shown in presentation documents LPC-1 through LPC-36 dated December 5, 2014, and LPC-1 through LPC-103 dated November 18, 2014, prepared by John H. Beyer, R.A., and submitted as components of the application and presented at the Public Hearing and Public Meeting. The proposal as initially presented at the Public Hearing of November 18, 2014, including a narrower setback at the east portion of the reconstructed 13th floor; a larger elevator bulkhead in plan; reconstructing the balustrades all in cast stone with a larger lozenge shaped opening; the installation of gates at the Broadway entrance; the removal of the fire escapes on the Leonard Street elevation and the installation of metal balconies; and the removal of a portion of the marble cladding from the walls of the relocated marble anteroom; as contained on presentation documents dated

November 18, 2014, submitted as components of the application, and presented at the Public Hearing and Public Meetings.

In reviewing this proposal, the Commission noted that the designation report describes 346 Broadway, the Former New York Life Insurance Company Building, Individual and Interior Landmark, as a neo-Italian Renaissance style monumental skyscraper with neo-Italian Renaissance style interiors designed by Stephen D. Hatch and McKim, Mead & White, and built in 1894-98. The Commission further noted that that the interior designation consists of a series of spaces from the ground through fourteenth floors and clock tower rooms. The Commission finally noted that the designation report for the interiors specifically attributes the design of the second floor executive office suite to Stephen D. Hatch, and the fourth floor presidential suite and the banking hall to McKim, Mead & White, credited specifically to Henry Bacon under the direction of William Rutherford Mead.

With regard to this proposal, the Commission found that the proposed work at the interior spaces will result in the restoration of most of the interior spaces and will allow accessibility by the public to the lobby and former banking hall, and will protect the wall finishes in the office spaces at the upper floors; that the proposed extensive restoration work and resetting of the sculptural eagles at the roofline will return the exterior and most of the interiors closer to their original appearances and is supportive of the long term preservation of the building and designated interiors; that although the creation of the proposed east core will necessitate the relocation of the 4th floor anteroom and the staircase adjacent to the banking hall, the majority of the rooms will be kept intact, and the core will allow for the adaptive use of this large building; that the inappropriate later alterations will be removed from the designated interior spaces including linoleum and terrazzo flooring, partition walls and fluorescent lighting; that the main lobby, stair hall, clock tower rooms and banking hall will be fully restored, and the clock mechanism and faces will be retained, thereby preserving these significant features; that the removal of modern partition walls from the Leonard Street lobby will eliminate features that detract from the interior; that the cast iron columns and decorative bronze grilles and framework at the elevator walls will be fully restored, and maintaining these areas as a semi-enclosed arcades will recall the enclosed semi-circular sense of the space; that the marble staircase and cast iron handrail connecting the first and second floors adjacent to the banking hall will be removed and relocated almost entirely intact to the lobby for the proposed commercial space, thereby preserving this historic feature in a publicly accessible location; that the second and fourth floor offices will be fully restored and encapsulated with reversible partitions in select locations, to allow for residential adaptive use while maintaining the historic finishes; that the decorative door surrounds will be removed and fully reinstalled to accommodate minor door shifts at these levels; that the marble anteroom at the fourth floor will be removed and relocated completely intact to the first floor, and the decorative plaster ceiling replicated, thereby preserving these finishes and the room's original configuration in a location accessible to tenants of the building; that the non-historic solid fire rated walls that enclose and obscure the fire stair hall will be removed at the first floor and replaced with a fire rated glass enclosure that will allow the stair to be fully viewed from this publicly accessible corridor; that the fire escapes on the Leonard Street elevation are not original to the building and were installed through decorative features, and while they are somewhat decorative, the presence of the fire escapes does not reflect a significant point in history or use of this building, therefore, their removal will not detract from the building; that the restoration of the façade will return it closer to its original appearance; that the proposed canopy on the Leonard Street elevation is well scaled to the entrance it serves; that the design and details of the canopy, including a glass roof and bronze cladding complement the materials palette of the building, and the slim profile fits neatly within the entrance infill; that the proposed window to door modifications require only the removal of minimal amounts of undecorated stone or brick, and will not disrupt the façade configurations; that the proposed door configurations at the Broadway, Leonard and Lafayette Street entrance will accommodate accessibility requirements while still relating to the solidity of the original design; that the vast majority of windows have

been previously replaced, therefore the proposed building-wide window replacement will not result in the removal of a significant amount of historic fabric; that the proposed aluminum windows will be consistent with the historic windows in terms of configuration, operation, finish, and profiled brickmold detailing; that the proposed enlarged interlocking circle motif at the roof balustrades recalls the design on the original drawings, and the balustrade will be constructed in cast stone with different aggregates and finishes to match the existing sections of terra cotta and marble materials, and the marble piers will be retained; that the recreation of a sculptural element at the Clocktower will return a terminating element to this location and will recall the historic design; that this building has had a history of visible rooftop additions and utilitarian/mechanical features, with some constructed shortly after the building was completed, therefore there is precedence for visible rooftop additions; that the removal of the existing rooftop penthouses, bulkheads and mechanical equipment will not eliminate significant historic fabric; that the proposed thirteenth floor addition is mostly obscured by the balustrades and surrounding buildings; that the proposed fourteenth floor is only visible through narrow view corridors at a distance from the building and appears setback from the Broadway clock tower and the Lafayette Street cupola, and therefore does not detract from the building's prominent roofline; and that the mechanical bulkheads are mostly visible against a backdrop of adjacent buildings, and the proposed neutral metal paneling has a minimal impact on the historic building. Based on these findings, the Commission determined the work to be appropriate to this Individual and Interior Landmark and voted to approve it.

However, in voting to approve this proposal the Commission required the applicant to record a restrictive declaration against the property that provided: (1) an acknowledgement that all designated interiors, whether converted to residential use or not, would continue to be subject to the requirements of the Landmarks Law; (2) that the Declarant would have no objection to a modification of the Designation Report for the Former New York Life Insurance Company Building to reflect the fact that (a) the stair case connecting the first and second floors east of the Banking Lobby would be relocated to the northeast corner of the commercial lobby space, and (b) the marble and other finishes of the fourth floor anteroom would be relocated to the first floor adjacent to the historic exit stair; (3) for the permanent operation of the exterior clock faces of the clock tower by electronic or mechanical means; (4) for the Declarant to make a reasonable good faith effort to recreate or reinterpret the historic globe, including figures and decorative elements, as permitted by the Department of Buildings; (5) for public access to the main Banking Hall, and that the main Banking Hall would not be used for residential purposes; (6) for a cyclical inspection, reporting and maintenance program for the designated interior spaces on the upper floors that would be converted to residential use; and (7) that Declarant and subsequent owners would provide reasonable access to the designated interior spaces to the LPC for periodic inspections and in response to reasonably credible complaints.

In addition, in voting to approve this proposal the Commission required that two complete sets of signed and sealed Department of Buildings filing drawings and restrictive declaration covering the clock and access to the designated interior spaces be submitted for review and approval by the staff of the Commission. Subsequently, on February 2, 2015, the staff received drawings labeled G-001.00, G-003.00 through G-005.00, Z-001.00 through Z-020.00, A-100.00 through A-102.00, A-104.00 through A-106.00, A-111.00 through A-140.00, A-201, A-202, A-205, A-206, A-211.00 through A-238.00, A-301.00 through A-304.00, A-321.00, A-322.00, A-326.00, A-331.00, through A-339.00, A-340 through A-349, A-351.00 through A-361.00, A-401.00 through A-408.00, A-410, A-411, A-420, A-421, A-501.00 through A-509.00, A-511.00 through A-518.00, A-530.00 through A-532.00, A-551, A-570.00, A-610.00, A-611.00, A-620.00 through A-623.00, A-640.00 through A-649.00, A-660.00 through A-670.00, A-801.00, A-821.00, A-822.00, A-831.00 through A-834.00, A-900.00 through A-903.00, A-910.00 through A-914.00, A-920.00 through A-923.00, A-930.00 through A-933.00, A-940.00 through A-942.00, A-950.00 through A-952.00, A-960.00 through A-965.00, A-970.00, A-971.00, A-980.00 dated September 15, 2014, prepared by John H. Beyer, R.A., drawings DMS-F101.00, DM-F102.00, DMS-005.00, DMS-006.00, DMS-011.00, DMS-012.00, DMS-

021.00, DMS-022.00, DMS-031.00, DMS-032.00, DMS-042.00, DMS-062.00, DMS-072.00, DMS-131.00, DMS-132.00, DMS-140.00, DMS-200.00, S-001.00, FO-200.00, S-002.00, S-005.00, S-006.00, S-011.00, S-012.00, S-021.00, S-022.00, S-031.00, S-032.00, S-041.00, S-042.00, S-051.00, S-052.00, S-061.00, S-062.00, S-071.00, S-072.00, S-081.00, S-082.00, S-091.00, S-092.00, S-101.00, S-102.00, S-111.00, S-112.00, S-121.00, S-122.00, S-125.00, S-131.00, S-132.00, S-141.00, S-142.00, S-150.00, S-500.00, S-600.00 through S-602.00, and S-700.00 dated September 15, 2014, prepared by Silvian L. Marcus, P.E., drawings FO-001.00 through FO-006.00, FO-101.00, FO-102.00 dated September 15, 2014, prepared by Walter E. Kaeck, P.E., drawings M-001.00, M-105.00, M-106.00, M-111.00 through M-120.00, M-131.00 through M-138.00, M-201.00, M-202.00, M-206.00, M-211.00, M-212.00, M-219.00, M-220.00, M-231.00 through M-234.00, M-500.00 through M-502.00, M-600.00, M-601.00, M-700.00 through M-702.00, P-001.00, P-098.00, P-099.00, P-101.00, P-102.00, P-105.00, P-106.00, P-111.00 through P-138.00, P-500.00, P-501.00, P-600.00, P-700.00 through P-702.00, P-710.00 through P-712.00, P-720.00, P-730.00, FP-001.00, FP-101.00, FP-102.00, FP-105.00, FP-106.00, FP-111.00 through FP-134.00, FP-137.00 through FP-141.00, FP-500.00, FP-501.00, FP-600.00, FP-700.00, dated September 15, 2014, prepared by Michael T. McGough, P.E., and drawings FPP-101 through FP-103, FPP-111 through FP-125 dated September 15, 2014, prepared by John H. Beyer, R.A. Staff reviewed these drawings and noted the inclusion of the following additional work within the designated interior: within the Leonard Street lobby, the construction of a bronze clad steel and glass vestibule; repair or replication of two (2) wall sconces, one (1) ceiling pendant, and six (6) pedestal fixtures; cleaning and restoring all marble wall and stair surfaces; the removal of conduit, devices and sprinklers at the ceiling and repairing the plaster; within the Banking Hall, the installation of recessed sprinkler heads at the ceiling; cleaning, repairing and repainting the decorative ceiling; at the walls, cleaning and repairing the marble surfaces; repainting the metal grilles and grillage; reattachment or installation of missing or loose components at the cast iron capitals; repairing the plaster moldings and entablature; raising the wrought iron railing for code compliance; at the historic exit stair, cleaning and repairing the marble wainscot and wall cladding and metal railing; the installation of sprinklers at the ceiling of the Leonard Street lobby and 14-16th floors of the Clocktower. The additional work at the building exterior and non-designated portions of the interior includes: on the Leonard Street elevation, the restoration of the cast iron window guards and installation of decorative ironwork at the main entrance fanlight; at the Broadway entrance apse, marble and terrazzo patching; the installation of two (2) bronze pedestal light fixtures at the niches; at the Catherine Lane elevation, the installation of full louvers at six (6) window openings at the fifth floor, eight (8) window openings at the ground floor, and two (2) transoms over entrances; the installation of a GFRC cornice; restorative work at all elevations, including cast iron restoration; marble cleaning, Dutchman and crack repair as required; brick and terra cotta replacement as required; granite Dutchman repair or new material at the base of the building; reinstallation and restoration of the ten (10) eagle sculptures at the roofline; the restoration of the copper cladding at the Lafayette pavilion roof; the replacement of the glazing at the clock faces; the construction of one (1) stair bulkhead at the center of the roof clad in standing seam zinc panels; the installation of roofing and a glass guardrail over the approved mechanical room at the east portion of the roof; and interior alterations at the cellar through thirteenth floors at non-designated portions of the interior, including the restoration of historic finishes, excavation work to accommodate new cores and elevators, and changes to non-bearing partition walls, finishes, and plumbing, structural, fire alarm, mechanical, and electrical systems.

With regard to these changes, the Commission finds that the proposed restorative work will return the facades and interior closer to their original appearance, and will aid in their long-term preservation; that any new stone, terra cotta, or brick will match the historic stone in terms of appearance, color, texture and profile; and that the finishes at the interior will be based on the results of an historic finish analysis. The Commission further finds in accordance with the Rules of the City of New York, Title 63, Section 2-11, that the windows are not special windows as defined in Chapter 3, Appendix C; that the proposal involves removing the window sash and retaining the window frame; that the locations of the louvers forms art of a

regular pattern of installations in window bays on the façade; that the louvers will be mounted flush with the sash; that the louvers will be finished to blend into the fenestration pattern; and that no significant architectural features of the building will be affected by the installations. The Commission finally finds in accordance with the R.C.N.Y., Title 63, Section 2-19, that the additional stair bulkhead and enclosing the mechanical room does not result in damage to, or demolition or, a significant architectural feature of the roof of the structure; and that these elements will not visible from a public thoroughfare. Based on this and the above findings, the drawings have been marked approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission with a perforated seal, and this Certificate of Appropriateness is being issued.

The Commission notes that the applicant will be submitting the Clocktower globe design under a separate application. Please note that this permit is being issued contingent upon the receipt of restoration work specifications. Please forward this to the Commission when it becomes available.

PLEASE NOTE: This permit is contingent upon the Commission's review and approval of samples of surface cleaning, Dutchman repairs, and new cladding material prior to the commencement of work. Samples should be installed adjacent to clean, original surfaces being repaired; allowed to cure; and cleaned of residue. Submit digital photographs of all samples to cbond1@lpc.nyc.gov for review. This permit is also contingent on the understanding that the work will be performed by hand and when the temperature remains a constant 45 degrees Fahrenheit or above for a 72 hour period from the commencement of the work.

This permit is issued on the basis of the building and site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this permit, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic building fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this permit, upon written notice to the applicant, in the event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

All approved drawings are marked approved by the Commission with a perforated seal indicating the date of the approval. The work is limited to what is contained in the perforated document. Other work or amendments to this filing must be reviewed and approved separately. The applicant is hereby put on notice that performing or maintaining any work not explicitly authorized by this permit may make the applicant liable for criminal and/or civil penalties, including imprisonment and fine. This letter constitutes the permit; a copy must be prominently displayed at the site while work is in progress. Please direct inquiries to Carly Bond.

Meenakshi Srinivasan
Chair

PLEASE NOTE: PERFORATED DRAWINGS AND A COPY OF THIS PERMIT HAVE BEEN SENT TO:
Kate Lemos McHale, Beyer Blinder Belle Architects & Planners LLP

cc: Jared Knowles, Director of Preservation/LPC